

# SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIALS

Committee on Academic and Workforce Success

## AGENDA ITEM V-H

### Report on the FY 2016 Annual Report of Low-Producing Programs

RECOMMENDATION: No action required

Background Information:

#### **List of Programs That Were Low-Producing Three Years in a Row**

The table on the following page lists programs that were low-producing three years in a row. The table shows staff comments about the current situation of the programs. Staff comments about the current situation include these categories:

- Action Pending: institution plans to close or consolidate the program.
- Program Restructured: institution restructured the program and/or invested in the program through faculty hiring, equipment enhancements, etc., or may have initiated new recruiting efforts such as articulation agreements.
- Retained in 2014: institution retained the program while it was in phase-out from closure under previous low-producing program rules; program typically is also restructured and has to build up declared majors and graduates.
- Reinstated in 2015: institution reinstated program while in phase-out responding to new demands in graduates.
- Increasing Enrollment: increasing enrollments make a recovery with larger graduate numbers likely.
- Program Split: program split from another program, keeping original start date and causing an incomplete graduate record for a five-year period.
- Past Reporting Error: a past reporting error causes a temporary, artificial dip in graduate numbers.
- Specialty Program: a program with a specific value to students and that has low graduation numbers for the foreseeable future because of the nature of the program.

Staff is not making recommendations, based on this year's review, to the institutions' governing boards for closure or consolidation of any of the programs that were low-producing three years in a row.

**List of Programs Low-Producing Three Years in a Row**

			Review Year			
			FY14	FY15	FY16	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			Staff Comment
Non-System - CTC						
Austin Community College	ENGINEERING-RELATED TECHNOLOGIES	AAS	23	22	17	Action Pending
Hill College	HEATING, AIR CONDITIONING, VENTILATION AND REFRIGERATION MAINTENANCE TECHNOLOGY/TECHNICIAN	AAS	18	15	2	Reinstated in 2015
	HEAVY/INDUSTRIAL EQUIPMENT MAINTENANCE TECHNOLOGIES	AAS	19	16	14	Reinstated in 2015
North Central Texas College	PRECISION METAL WORKING	AAS	0	0	0	Action Pending
Northeast Texas Community College	AGRICULTURAL BUSINESS AND MANAGEMENT	AAS	14	16	18	Reinstated in 2015
Odessa College	SURGICAL TECHNOLOGY/TECHNOLOGIST	AAS	0	0	0	Reinstated in 2015
Texarkana College	HUMAN DEVELOPMENT, FAMILY STUDIES, AND RELATED SERVICES	AAS	17	19	18	Increasing Enrollment
Wharton County Junior College	GRAPHIC COMMUNICATIONS	AAS	0	0	5	Program Split
Texas State Technical College						
Texas State Technical College-Harlingen	EMERGENCY MEDICAL TECHNOLOGY/TECHNICIAN (EMT PARAMEDIC)	AAS	17	10	4	Action Pending
Lone Star College System District						
Lone Star College - Montgomery	COMPUTER AND INFORMATION SCIENCES, GENERAL	AAS	20	22	22	Retained in 2014
Non-System - Universities						
Midwestern State University	NURSING-NURSE EDUCATOR	MSN	8	11	13	Action Pending
Stephen F. Austin State University	SCHOOL MATHEMATICS TEACHING	MS	12	0	4	Program Restructured
Texas Southern University	THEATRE	BA	23	22	20	Program Restructured
Texas Woman's University	MATHEMATICS-MATHEMATICS TEACHING	MS	13	8	8	Past Reporting Error
	MOLECULAR BIOLOGY	PHD	9	8	9	Program Restructured

(continued)			Review Year			
			FY14	FY15	FY16	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			Staff Comment
Texas A&M University System						
Tarleton State University	ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE	MS	9	10	11	Program Restructured
Texas A&M University	RECREATION AND RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT	MRRD	1	1	2	Program Split
Texas A&M University & TAMU Health Science Center	HEALTH PROMOTION AND COMMUNITY HEALTH SCIENCES	DRPH	0	6	6	Program Restructured
Texas A&M University-Commerce	PHYSICS	BA BS	21	21	23	Program Restructured
	BROADFIELD SCIENCE PHYSICS					
	HEALTH	BA BS	20	11	12	Action Pending
Texas A&M University-Kingsville	MUSIC EDUCATION	MM	13	10	6	Action Pending
	CHEMISTRY	BA BS	15	18	22	Increasing Enrollment
	ACCOUNTING	MPACC	14	9	3	Action Pending
Texas A&M University-Texarkana	ENGLISH	MA	12	10	11	Program Restructured
West Texas A&M University	STUDIO ART	MFA	9	11	9	Specialty Program
Texas State University System						
Lamar State College-Port Arthur	MENTAL AND SOCIAL HEALTH SERVICES AND ALLIED PROFESSIONS	AAS	7	9	7	Retained in 2014
	ACCOUNTING AND RELATED SERVICES	AAS	5	0	12	Retained in 2014
Lamar University	HISTORY	MA	9	6	7	Program Restructured
Sam Houston State University	COMPOSITE SCIENCE	BS	7	3	3	Program Restructured
Sul Ross State University	ENGLISH	BA	24	23	23	Increasing Enrollment
	INDUSTRIAL TECHNOLOGY	BS	11	9	9	Retained in 2014
	THEATRE	BFA	15	12	12	Retained in 2014
	CHEMISTRY	BS	2	1	2	Retained in 2014
	PSYCHOLOGY	MA	4	3	2	Retained in 2014

(continued)			Review Year			
			FY14	FY15	FY16	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			Staff Comment
Sul Ross State University	POLITICAL SCIENCE	BA	12	10	9	Retained in 2014
	POLITICAL SCIENCE	MA	9	7	4	Retained in 2014
	ART	BFA	16	16	15	Retained in 2014
	ART	MA	5	5	5	Retained in 2014
	MUSIC	BA	10	13	12	Retained in 2014
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	READING SPECIALIST	MED	13	6	7	Specialty program
Texas State University	MATERIALS PHYSICS	MS	2	4	3	Action Pending
<b>Texas Tech University System</b>						
Texas Tech University	AGRIBUSINESS	BS	19	22	21	Program Restructured
	ZOOLOGY	BS	18	17	15	Action Pending
	GEOSCIENCES	PHD	9	8	8	Increasing Enrollment
<b>The University of Texas System</b>						
The University of Texas at Austin	ITALIAN	BA	24	23	24	Program Restructured
The University of Texas at Dallas	SOFTWARE ENGINEERING	PHD	8	7	6	Program Restructured
	BIOINFORMATICS AND COMPUTATIONAL BIOLOGY	MS	14	10	9	Specialty Program
	COMMUNICATION SCIENCES AND DISORDERS	PHD	8	7	2	Program Restructured
The University of Texas at El Paso	MUSIC THEATER	BFA	15	11	7	Action Pending
The University of Texas at Tyler	STUDIO ART	MFA	13	12	10	Program Restructured
	ART	MA				
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	IMMUNOLOGY AND INFECTION	MS	0	0	2	Program Restructured
The University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston	MEDICAL SCIENCE RESEARCH	MMS	13	11	9	Specialty Program

(continued)			Review Year			
			FY14	FY15	FY16	
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods			Staff Comment
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	INFORMATION SYSTEMS	BS	14	19	21	Program Restructured
<b>University of Houston System</b>						
University of Houston-Downtown	HUMANITIES	BA	22	19	21	Program Restructured

### Update on Fiscal Year 2015 Review

Coordinating Board staff recommended two programs for phase-out during last year's review: the Tarleton State University Masters of Science program in Environmental Science and The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio Masters of Science program in Immunology and Infection. The institutions and their governing boards retained both programs while implementing significant restructuring measures to rebuild the programs. Coordinating Board staff does not recommend closure of these programs based on this year's review.

### History of the Coordinating Board's Review of Low-Producing Programs

Different rules were in place for the agency's review of low-producing programs during the first three years of review, the reviews of fiscal years 2011 to 2013, and the last three years, for fiscal years 2014 to 2016. During the first three years the Coordinating Board either closed or consolidated programs that were low-producing or granted temporary exemptions from closure. During the most recent three years of review Coordinating Board staff had the option to recommend closure or consolidation to the institutions' governing boards, if a program was low-producing for three years in a row. Temporary exemptions from closure given in the past are honored going forward.

The table on the following page shows numbers of low-producing programs and the actions taken. While during last year's review, the 2015 review, nine percent of low-producing programs were low-producing for three years in a row, the proportion increased to 30 percent during this year's review. One reason is that previously given temporary exemptions from review expired.

Thirty percent of programs that were low-producing during the 2014 review were either closed or recovered in the following year and similarly twenty-seven percent of programs that were low-producing during last year's review (2015) were either closed or recovered prior to the 2016 review. The overall number of low-producing programs remained about the same. The number is expected to increase next year, because of the end of additional temporary exemptions. The overall number of programs reviewed is about 5,200.

**History of the Coordinating Board's Review of Low-Producing Programs (LPP)**

<b>LPP Action</b>	<b>FY 2011 Review</b>	<b>FY 2012 Review</b>	<b>FY 2013 Review</b>	<b>LPP Action</b>	<b>FY 2014 Review</b>	<b>FY 2015 Review</b>	<b>FY 2016 Review</b>
Review of one 5- year period	<b>FY 06- 10</b>	<b>FY 07- 11</b>	<b>FY 08- 12</b>	Review of three 5-year periods	<b>FY 07- 13</b>	<b>FY 08- 14</b>	<b>FY 09- 15</b>
<b>Total LPP</b>	<b>527</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>113</b>	<b>Total LPP</b>	<b>64</b>	<b>181</b>	<b>178</b>
Consolidated	89	11	12	LPP three years in a row	0	17	54
Institution phase- out	144	25	14	Sufficient graduates the following year to not be LPP	14	37	NA
Exempted	234	33	82	Closed or consolidated the following year	5	11	NA
Closed or consolidated	60	12	5	Recommended for close-out	0	2	0